2007 Capacity-Building Workshop for the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme

26 November–1 December 2007
Ahmedabad, India

Organised by
Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU)

in cooperation with
UNESCO and Japanese National Commission for UNESCO
2007 Capacity-Building Workshop for the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme

26 November–1 December 2007
Ahmedabad, India

Organised by
Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU)

in cooperation with
UNESCO and Japanese National Commission for UNESCO
# Table of Contents

## Chapter I  Introduction  .................................................. 3
1. Introduction
2. Overview of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme

## Chapter II  Proceedings  .................................................. 7

## Chapter III  Summary Reports and Presentations  .................. 29
1. Innovation Programme for ESD -10 projects in 10 countries
   Bhutan, China, Indonesia, Malaysia, Mongolia, Nepal, Palau, Thailand, Uzbekistan, Viet Nam
2. Centre of Excellence (COE) Programme for ESD -5 organisations
   Asian South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education (ASPBae)
   Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)
   Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)
   TVE Asia Pacific (TVEAP)
   The University of the South Pacific (USP)

## Chapter IV  Specific Issues in ESD  .................................. 131
1. Linking to Policy-Making
2. Sustainability of Projects
3. Monitoring and Evaluation
4. Effective Communication
5. Partnership and Networking

## Annexes  ................................................................. 143
1. General Information of the Workshop
2. Workshop Programme
3. List of Participants
4. Pre-Workshop Expectations
5. Post-Workshop Evaluation Summary
6. Prospectus of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme
CHAPTER I

Introduction

1. Introduction

2. Overview of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme
Introduction

The Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), a Tokyo-based non-profit organisation, has joined in the worldwide call to promote a sustainable future by advancing the goals of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD, 2005-2014). ACCU’s overall vision in ESD undertakings is to support community-led activities and link them to broader initiatives at the global level.

As an agency operating at the Asia-Pacific regional level covering over some forty countries, ACCU has placed a premium, since its inception in 1971, on creating synergetic effects among its programme partners in educational and cultural fields across the region. This has been realised in part by offering participatory opportunities for dialogue, sharing of experiences and collaboration such as in developing hands-on educational materials to translate UNESCO’s ideals into action. Based on these tenets, the present workshop titled the “2007 Capacity-Building Workshop for the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme” was held in Ahmedabad, India from 26 November to 1 December 2007, in the presence of twenty-one representatives from fifteen different countries, who had been selected openly from the Asia-Pacific region to take part in the quest for Education for Sustainable Development.

As such, this report compiles and illustrates ongoing teaching and learning activities in view of sustainable development by the implementing partners of the “ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme”. The Programme consists of ten community-led projects in ten countries under the Innovation Programme for ESD, and five appointed organisations under the Centre of Excellence (COE) Programme for ESD.

It was of particular importance that the workshop took place in conjunction with the 4th International Conference on Environmental Education (ICCE, 26-28 November 2007, Ahmedabad, India), organised by the Government of India, UNESCO, UNEP and hosted by the Centre for Environment Education, allowing workshop participants to gain broader understanding of the history, concept and practices of ESD across the globe and learn from innovative ideas and initiatives.

From the experiences shared through the six-day workshop, it became evident that various undertakings not only helped the learners involved to acquire practical knowledge and skills in a specified field of competence, but also nurtured self-confidence, inter-generational communication and/or inter-disciplinary partnerships in many instances as a common by-product of engaging in ESD. It is noteworthy that underprivileged people, such as children with disabilities and illiterate adults in rural areas, are encouraged to join in the quest for building a sustainable future. Another positive element unveiled from respective projects was that schools and local communities are joining hands in the effort to explore quality teaching and learning, notably by nurturing well-rounded individuals equipped with academic knowledge, vocational skills and caring hearts alike.

Being faced with mounting challenges in sustaining far-sighted ESD practice in many parts of the world, it is hoped that the collective voices and approaches documented in this report from the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme will provide impetus to many stakeholders for finding locally relevant ideas to pursue a sustainable and dignified future.
Overview of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme

Supported by the UNESCO/Japan Funds-in-Trust for ESD, the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme, was developed in response to the launch of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD: 2005-2014) as an exemplar model for activities that would promote education for sustainable development in the Asia-Pacific region. The ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme consists of two sub-programmes: 1) Innovation Programme for ESD (project-based), and 2) COE Programme for ESD (institutional-based).

Innovation Programme for ESD

The Innovation Programme for ESD aims to initiate and support projects that will serve as good examples for the implementation and promotion of Education for Sustainable Development in the Asia-Pacific region. Ten community-based projects were selected openly in 2006 from ten countries in Asia and the Pacific for a two-year duration. Model practices of ESD will be identified and shared for emulation across the region.

Bound by a common vision of sustainability, these undertakings address various themes such as technical and vocational education, disaster preparedness, literacy and agriculture, and inclusive education, covering both the formal and non-formal spaces of learning. While some of these projects are led by non-governmental organisations, others are initiated by government agencies mainly in charge of non-formal education. Special attention is given to the needs of underprivileged people with limited access to quality education.

COE Programme for ESD

The COE Programme for ESD aims to support institutions with outstanding track records in relevant fields of Education for Sustainable Development to become a catalyst for change. Five organisations were appointed as Centres of Excellence (COE) from the Asia-Pacific region with a five-year mandate (2006-2010). COEs provide and support educational initiatives that lead to community empowerment, and contribute to building the capacity of institutions, civil society organisations and communities to address ESD issues in their fields of competence. The COE will also advocate integrating the ESD agenda into policy, programmes, curricula and practices at various levels.

For more information about the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme, please see its Prospectus included in the Annex, and/or visit the Web site for updates: http://www.accu.or.jp/esd
CHAPTER II

Proceedings

In front of the workshop venue (Hotel Klassic Gold, Ahmedabad)
Session 1: Sharing of the ICEE

Preceding the workshop, a group of twenty-one invitees attended the 4th International Conference on Environmental Education (ICEE, 26-28 November 2007), joining over 1,500 other individuals gathered from around the world to the ICEE. In addition to plenary sessions, each participant took part in one or more of the thirty working groups that catered to diverse interests according to his/her own effort in pursuing a sustainable future. Many of the ACCU group participants contributed to the discussion of the working groups on "Reorienting Formal Education towards ESD" and/or "Non-Formal Spaces of Learning" by drawing upon their expertise and experiences in these areas. These discussions culminated in the adoption of the "Ahmedabad Declaration 2007: A Call to Action" and the Overall Recommendation of the Conference on the final day of the ICEE.

Furthermore, ACCU organised a group presentation on 27 November in cooperation with the ICEE Conference Secretariat, UNESCO and the implementing partners of the "ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme" to highlight the Programme’s past year’s progress at a special session of ICEE, in the presence of UNESCO representatives and other audience numbering about fifty persons in total. Please see the box blow for more details about the group discussion.

At the ICEE exhibition, ACCU and partner organisations displayed and distributed hands-on educational materials on ESD such as the multi-lingual Package Learning Materials on Environment (PLANET), which were received favourably by many visitors.

---

**ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme**

"Supporting grassroots initiatives in ESD and linking it with global partnerships"

A Group presentation and discussion at ICEE’s special session
Programme (27 November 2007, 11:30-13:00)

Opening and Introductory Remarks
Dr. Derek Elias, Asia-Pacific Coordinator, Education for Sustainable Development, UNESCO Bangkok

Case Presentations
- **NEPAL:** Integrated Environmental Literacy Programme for Poverty Alleviation through Income Generation Programme and Quality of Life Improvement of Girls and Women and Disadvantaged Populations through Community Learning Centres (CLC) by Ms. Shanti Shova Shakya, National Resource Center for Non-Formal Education
- **CHINA:** Education for Sustainable Development in Rural Primary and Secondary School by Mr. Yao Chunsheng, China Program Committee of Education for Sustainable Development
- **THAILAND:** COE Programme by Thailand Environment Institute by Dr. Ampai Harakunarak, TEI
- **TVE-Asia Pacific:** "Saving the Planet – An Asia Pacific Profiling Innovative Projects producing, distributing, promoting a regional TV series on innovative ESD activities"

Vision and Direction of the ACCU-UNESCO ESD Programme
Dr. NAGATA Yoshiyuki, University of the Sacred Heart, Tokyo

Sharing of Good Practices in ESD and Disaster Reduction Education
Dr. GOTO Masakazu, National Institute for Educational Policy Research (NIER) of Japan

Facilitated by: Ms. SHIBAIO Tomoko, Director, Education Division, ACCU
At the beginning of the workshop (29 November-1 December 2007) which immediately followed the ICEE, participants took a moment to reflect on the experiences in the ICEE at the facilitation of Ms. Cresantia Koya of the University of the South Pacific, in which the following points were mentioned:

- Importance of partnerships between people, organisations, inter-generational communication
- Need for a holistic approach, reconceptualising ESD, and looking beyond environment
- Importance of both formal & non-formal spaces of learning
- ICT as a tool, but considering the difficulties of access
- Recognising that we are all stakeholders, every one of us
- Reviewing and rethinking the methods

Workshop participants in front of the ICEE’s Entrance Gate

- I participated in Formal Education at ICEE, which many people from different countries attended. I have learned that ESD projects should be based on the principle of democracy and equity. I also realised that there are many resources around the world that I could use in our project for achieving its goals.
- The Working Group on Non-Formal Space for Learning was the best group I attended during ICEE. In this working group – participants conceptualised on non-formal education and could relate how to fit it in with environmental issues for learning. It was a great chance to promote NFE for ESD.

Additional comments regarding the participation in ICEE can be found in the Annex titled “Post-Workshop Evaluation Summary”.

For more information about the ICEE including the full text of the Ahmedabad Declaration 2007, please visit the ICEE Conference Web site at the following: http://www.tbilisiplus30.org/
Session 2: Sharing of Experiences

Marking the first-ever occasion for all the implementing partners of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme to gather together after a full year of project implementation, participants representing each of the ten projects of the Innovation Programme for ESD (IP) reported on their projects. In a similar vein, representatives of selected agencies of the Centres of the Excellence (COE) updated on their first-year COE activities. In addition to oral presentations, many participants brought tangible outputs of their projects such as educational materials (textbooks/posters) and project leaflets for display and distribution, illustrating their activities in a concrete manner.

Based on the indicative guidelines provided below, Innovation Programme partners were encouraged to touch upon the following set of questions categorised by 1) background, 2) outcome of activities/processes, 3) added value that might have been brought about by the ESD principles, and 4) future challenges, in hopes of facilitating each to relate to other projects that were not necessarily being undertaken in the same fields but rather bound by a common vision of sustainability.

**Presentation Guidelines**

[Background]
- What are the present situations in your community/country that you are trying to address through your project?
- How does the concept of education for sustainable development (ESD) relate to your ongoing activities?

[Outcome of Activities/Processes]
- What major progress have you made so far in your ESD project?
- How important do you think the process of project planning and implementation is?

[Added Value brought about by the ESD principles]
- Have you tried out a new/innovative method or approach in your teaching and learning activities?
- What benefit did you gain most from your present project?

[Future Plans/Challenges]
- What do you intend to do in the second year of your project?
- What challenges lie ahead in continuing your activities?

At the facilitation of Mr. Bernie Lovegrove from ASPBAE, projects in Viet Nam, Uzbekistan, Malaysia, Palau, Indonesia, Thailand, Bhutan, Nepal, China, and Mongolia under the Innovation Programme for ESD were presented in that order.

Aside from the official presentation, participants were also asked to bring themselves proverbs, sayings, folktales, poems, episodes, and/or well-known remarks from their country/region that seem to capture the essence of ESD. The collected items were shared at individual presentations as well as in relevant discussion on the topic of ESD and culture.
Presentation 1: Viet Nam
Ms. Nguyen Thu Hien, Center for Education of Exceptional Children (CEEC)
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III)

Key points
- Video presentation on the organisation & children with special needs
- Children with disabilities are usually not able to join school with other kids of their age, they are usually 2-4 yrs behind; That is why CEEC provides early intervention programmes.
- House-to-house survey to obtain information
- Community-based awareness: literacy levels are low, area is mountainous, indigenous peoples who speak languages other than Vietnamese – all obstacles to providing information
- Need to provide the information individually, family by family
- A home-based model developed by a Dutch organisation
- Due to the local-based programme, our information is more acceptable to govt agencies
- Currently working on a policy programme which will be approved in 2008
- We cannot implement the project if we don’t have support of local authorities, parents, INGOs and experts
- Some children need medical assistance – surgical operations can help them recover from disabilities
- Communicating with the local authorities is very difficult – they don’t have many phones, and no internet or fax machine; sometimes the language and dialect they speak is different

Discussion
Q: How do you communicate with target groups?
A: Mainly through telephone to local authorities, with the centre bearing the costs. We don’t have power to enhance telecommunications facilities.
Q: Your example can be a model for many countries. You have many obstacles, so what kind of impact is there? Is the project implemented entirely through the local authority, and does your NGO have little direct involvement?
A: Our model – in the first year, we had a lot of training, for local staff, teachers and others in community. The project staff & key local staff work together in the first year, and then we give them more and more opportunities to do the work on their own. At the end of 2 yrs we want them to work on their own. Initially, the project was for visually-impaired children.
Q: What media or communications materials are being used?
A: People who communicate directly are parents or teachers. Pre-school level intervention uses local radio to spread information about what things you can do with your children if they have disabilities, and we also have materials shared with teachers and parents at home visits. Television shows – local channels carried two programmes on our house surveys recently.
Q: Connection to ESD?
A: ESD is still being defined. Children with disabilities and their parents are an integral part of society, and they too have a role in sustainable development. Children with disabilities too need to have knowledge and they can be valuable contributors.

A floor comment: This project might fit more within Education for All contexts rather than ESD. It is good to provide education for the disabled children, but we need to think about a direct connection to ESD. This may apply to several other presentations as well, so perhaps this issue can be re-visited later.
Presentation 2: Uzbekistan
Ms. Dilnoza Kurbanova, National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan for UNESCO
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III)

Key points
- We created a kindergarten resource centre, for organising mobile training teams
- Secondary school in Uzbekistan includes both primary and secondary school
- ADB has also started a project on inclusive education programme, with materials development

Discussion
Q: What is the definition of inclusive education? When you work on this project, do you think this has impact on the system or only on individuals and individual schools?
A: In Uzbekistan, inclusive education means that we bring children with disabilities to the mainstream classrooms
Q: Do you separate children with more severe disabilities, and put them into special institutions? Do you have different levels of integration?
A: We have specialised institutions for disabled children, but we begin to integrate children early. First step, children with disabilities are sent to normal secondary school, but some parents don’t want to put the children into normal classrooms because of their physical limitations.
Q: Is there any community participation?
A: We have NGOs, people with disabilities who work with NGOs who help us to integrate the children. The community is involved.

A floor comment: Does a project need to have all 4 pillars represented in the project to be a ESD? This is perhaps something we need to look at.

Final comments from the Presenter: We must work with parents. In Uzbekistan, they try to hide the children from neighbours. In kindergarten, we integrate mentally and physically challenged children, which helps them to socially integrate. We also monitor the children and parents.

Presentation 3: Malaysia
Ms. Trixie Kinajil, Kadazandusun Language Foundation (KLF)
Oral presentation and handouts

Key points
- Malaysia is a diverse country; but when people think of Malaysians they tend to think that there are only Malay, Chinese & Tamil people.
- There are over 120 languages; 90% of those are spoken by minority indigenous groups
- Island of Borneo – shared by Malaysia (north & west), Brunei and Indonesia (Kalimantan)
- Sabah is the State I come from; I am from Kadazandusun ethnic group, half million people
- They live in the forests, away from electricity and running water and other basic privileges we know and have
- KLF was started in 1995, because my community leader said we must do all we can to support our language
- Sabah joined the Malaysia constitution in 1963, we find that many people want to speak Malay or English
- With the language, we also lost many important aspects of our culture and traditions
- Bobohizan – a Kadazandusun priestess, and her main job is to take care of nature
- Now, because people don’t want to be rice farmers, she has nothing to do, she has lost respect although she used to be the person who held the community together
• KLF also works with community, we have to serve our community and train them in literacy and language, and how they understand their language and their traditions
• Your language is your link to your culture; your ancestors have left you with good knowledge – you can know things about the nature around you, what tree to cut, what are indicators of natural disaster etc
• Togudon – village at the further end of the border to next district, about 10km long, people live in a valley; most people are farmers and used to grow organic vegetables and now have moved to growing shitake mushrooms
• We want to do more than merely teach the language, we want to empower them
• How is literacy related to ESD? We are giving people training not only in language, but also how to communicate from the heart
• We work with many local organisations; I have called other organisations and challenged them to work with us, to use their knowledge and their expertise
• I work with families, to help write down their stories – capture the stories that they have to tell about their relationship with nature
• When parents & children get together to talk about their stories of nature, they feel like they’re part of sustainable development
• Togudon has been considered as the last village before the next state; they are the poorest, most ignorant etc
• One story: the parents wrote about the “Crying River” a story about the river as if it was alive, saying goodbye to the fish & birds who were going away because the river was dirty and polluted
• Work to help these communities to be more empowered, give them more of a voice, share their story with others
• The only way indigenous groups learn best is to see something and to understand it themselves

Discussion
Q: How do you share the knowledge of this community with other communities, and what are your plans?
A: We are planning to do a documentary video. This village has been closely working with a local NGO, so we hope to start a teacher training programme from Togudon to share the learning and experience. We hope to share these experiences with about 25 villages; our government’s non-formal education programme is not strong.
Q: What are the anthropological links with Kadazandusun with another part of Indonesian tribes? Have you done any research?
A: The word dusun is translated as orchard, farm in Malay and Indonesian. It’s a word given by outsiders. We call ourselves Kadazan. In Kalimantan, there’s a tribe called watu-dusun, again a name given to people who live and work in nature. So maybe there is a link there.
Q: How do you define the border-type people in terms of ESD?
A: We have issues of displacement, with half a million immigrants (considered illegal) from the Philippines – impact of that on ESD is great. Do people from this area have more rights than the illegal immigrants? There’s only one school for Filipino immigrants in Sabah, and that has been established by UNESCO.

Presentation 4: Palau
Mr. Ted Telchahl Merep, Emmaus High School
Oral presentation (See the full text of the speech in Chapter III)

Key points
• Emmaus High School’s Vocational Education Program – a private mission school
• Ted (presenter) himself is a product of Emmaus High School
• Training school for young men to become self-sufficient
• Plenty of boys don't have skills - hands-on activities; not pen and paper work
• Began with agriculture; now also cabinet making, building
• Last year 11 students joined the Project for 3 years
• Participants get a certificate from the School Board
• If young boys don't have such opportunities, they tend to get involved in drugs

Presentation 5: Indonesia
Mr. Abdul Wahab, Indonesia Forum for Environment (Wahli) – West Java
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III)

Key points
• Capacity-Building of Community-Based Disaster Response (volcano management)
• 7 high risk volcanoes in West Java that can have a huge impact on people and the environment
• Communities need to have the capacity to respond & cope with the situation
• So it is an ESD approach to work with these communities (volunteers forming a task force)
• Community risk and hazard training
• Using community approach: innovative learning - puppets and drawing on local context; & local participation, needs flexibility regarding Ramadan
• Outcomes: increased awareness & capacities of volunteers and communities; Want to replicate this work in other areas where there are volcanoes
• Challenges: Limited resources & expertise; Lack of government support

Discussion
Q: How do you measure your outcome of increased awareness?
A: We see how they are speaking & quality of community discussions
Q: Who are the main target groups in the communities?
A: Women & children, communities are very patriarchal

Presentation 6: Thailand
Ms. Wongduan Suwansiri, OBEC, Ministry of Education
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III)

Key points
• Participatory Learning Leading to Integrated Community Development
• Education structure in Thailand
• New project & how ESD is integrated into the curriculum at Bansunkong school
• Training and follow-up provided for teachers
• Encourage experiential learning
• Teacher also as the learner
• They develop the ESD curriculum by themselves after the training
• Problem-based learning; students take initiative in their learning in the community
• Uses Kite model

Presentation 7: Bhutan
Mr. Sonam Phuntsho, Non-formal and Continuing Education Division, Ministry of Education
Oral presentation (See the full text of speech in Chapter III) and photos on screen
Key points
- Introduction to Bhutan, the people, religions, government, forest cover, economy etc
- History of Non-formal Education in Bhutan
- Currently 20,000 students and over 750 instructors in the NFE programme today (in all 20 districts of Bhutan)
- NFE provided an opportunity for some further education, during the period when Bhutan was closed to the outside world
- NFE is being used to communicate awareness on social programmes, like HIV awareness programme
- Innovation Programme for ESD (IP) project runs in 3 districts
- The poultry rearing segment was considered the best, but has had to be temporarily halted because of the avian flu; many learners have turned to passion fruit cultivation instead
- Outputs: workshop to develop the handbook, translation of book into Dzongkha language, orientation workshop for NFE learners etc
- Values/benefits of the ESD project, and future plans/challenges (see Chapter III)

Presentation 8: Nepal
Ms. Shanti Shova Shakya & Ms. Shila Bajracharya
National Resource Center for Non-Formal Education (NRC-NFE)
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III)

Discussion
Q: How do you use Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs)?
A: We use it to teach alphabet, the language and also with VCDs, etc. After they learn, they are confident enough to chat online.
Q: How do you communicate ESD?
A: It's a complex issue, so we communicate through some environmental programmes where we can communicate on environment issues.

Presentation 9: Mongolia
Dr. Batchuluun Yembuu, National Centre for Non-Formal and Distance Education (NFDE), Ministry of Education, Culture and Science
PowerPoint presentation (See also Chapter III) and handouts

Key points:
- Current situation (new society -post socialism- environment issues, mining industry etc)
- Developing National Curriculum of Non FormaI Education for Sustainable Development
- Introduction of teaching and learning materials

Presentation 10: China
Mr. Yao Chunsheng
China Program Committee of Education for Sustainable Development (CPCESD)
PowerPoint Presentation (See also Chapter III) and handout

Key points:
- Trying to promote innovation in teaching: for example - Chinese, math & science teacher work together to teach about sandstorms: Chinese teachers teach about writing an essay, math teachers about statistics, science teachers about the mechanism, etc.
Session 2: Sharing of Experiences (continued from Day 1)

USP Presentation: Ms. Cresanta Koya
PowerPoint Presentation (See also Chapter III)

Key points
- Focus on 3 main components (Sustainability Education, Teacher Education, Community Empowerment)
- Revision of Distance & Flexible Learning to integrate ESD themes
- Indigenous Education Research and Development
- Stories on ESD. Need to value story telling; getting PI people to tell and record their stories
- Commonwealth Youth Program (CYP) is housed at USP
- Books introduced (eg Tree of Opportunity; Educational ideas from Oceania – Konai Thaman; Ta Kupesi – research methods from Tonga: research methods need to be culturally attuned)

Discussion
Q: How are the three components linked?
A: Heads of Schools & Departments meet regularly eg. Prof Thaman & Prof Koshy
   We recognise the importance of bottom up equally, and also focus on teachers and youth.
Q: How to develop a common curriculum for all Pacific Island Countries (PICs)?
A: We don’t have a standard curriculum. There are regional organisations, eg. PRIDE, looking to maintain standards within the region but allowing those in each country to develop curriculum. However USP offers teacher education across the Pacific
Q: How do you coordinate between the three areas within the University? This can be very problematic.
A: Now there is much greater integration; relevant staff are brought in so there is cross-fertilisation from the various disciplines.

A floor comment: ESD activities in many parts of the world tend to be handled separately by educators and scientists. This is why the effort being made at USP is quite important in bridging this gap.

TVEAP Presentation: Ms. Manori Wijesekera
PowerPoint Presentation (See also Chapter IV)

Key points
- TVEAP slogan: Moving Images, Moving People
- Saving the Planet Project – a TV series for the Asia Pacific that showcases 6 innovative ESD activities (Cambodia, Laos, Thailand, India, Nepal, Philippines selected)
- Cf. the Web site www.tveap.org and the Saving the Planet updates
- TVEAP are journalists-Information alone is not enough, stories from real people, telling their own story – powerful communicator, being able to connect at an emotional level
- Strengthening the communications skills of organisations whose work is filmed
- CB process: developed a module at a 5-day workshop in Thailand; 18 participants involved
- Focused on communicating development for awareness raising, advocacy, activism, NFE, and training purposes
• Next steps: location filming, editing & ready by end of Year 2, Distribution – Year 3  
• Partnership with IPs and COEs

Discussions

Q: Are videos available in local languages? 
A: Yes (eg Thai, Khmer, etc)

Q: Feedback on impact
A: Yes – anecdotal. Always hard to attribute impact or decision to act as a result of watching a video. (eg. Nepal video, led to follow-up; also after shrimp farming which degrades the soil. A tree that can help regenerate – story came from Ecuador, so value of cross-cultural information exchange) After training, CSOs have gone on to produce their own videos. TVEAP never trains on the technical side of video production, rather on the communications side; encourage them to work with local technical experts. Videos have become quite cheap, yet there are skills involved in producing a video; communications principles, thinking through the story-line in advance, etc

Q: Which TV channels? 
A: Channel eye, others

Q: How to cooperate with TVEAP to make good videos 
A: We can keep interested organisations in mind when they have training. This is just the first series. We hope to have a second series by the end of the decade.

After sharing of the experiences, participants moved on to discuss issues that had been identified as common areas of interests in tackling the challenges of their ESD projects. Topics included 1) Linking to Policy Making, 2) Sustainability of Projects, 3) Monitoring and Evaluation, 4) Effective Communication, and 5) Partnerships and Networking.
Session 3-A: Linking to Policy Making

Presentation by Ms. Ampai Harakunarak, Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)
Powerpoint Presentation (See Chapter IV)

Main issues
1. Raising visibility on ESD policy making
2. Clarifying strategic priorities for policy integration
3. Demonstrating government's understanding that ESD is a fundamental priority

Main points of the discussion
- Knowing existing policies & related budgets
- Developing grounded analysis that identifies policy priorities, programmes and current gaps. This to be built on research and to undertake new research
- Identifying core interested people in the system & dialogue & educate them, including about existing government achievements
- Following-up policy makers, monitoring & watch function
- There should be a national launch of ESD in a country – Thailand will have DESD launch on 14 Dec 2007
- Policy might have an important role – for instance, you can get other agencies to collaborate with you, you can access funds.
- You do not need policy in place to do your work in ESD, but it helps to have a policy framework because it helps to convince agencies and organisations to take on board the principles of ESD. For those not in formal education and in this field, ESD is another term, another piece of jargon. So policy alone is also not enough, we need to do our part to make people aware that ESD is something that affects all our lives, it impacts each one.
- What groundwork needs to be in place, or what can our organisations do to encourage the development of ESD policy?
- My organisation is working with the govt’s educational bureau to develop a policy on how ESD can be carried out in schools. If you want to work with govt departments you must understand that they want to create quality education. If the governments think you can help, then they want to cooperate with you. Also, we try to involve them in our activities - we invite officials to our workshops, give them opportunity to encourage teachers to carry the message of ESD.
- Different levels of different government have different roles. If you think of who your allies are in government and who can influence or reach someone else, and thereon. For example, because we are a regional org we have been able to come in at national level because they don’t want to have international bad publicity, but this has been difficult for some other local organisations to do. And if the Minister or other official won’t talk to us – we need to find is there someone else who can be a champion for this cause, to whom they will listen?
- Another group that we need to focus on is researchers and academia; and also international organisations, because often they come with funds. Mobilising these groups can assist in promoting policy.
- We have different ways of putting ESD into educational policy. I believe that EE and ESD leads to the best quality of education – when we inform the schools of this, they are more open to integrating ESD into their programmes. They are more open if we present it as an enhancement of their school.
- In Japan, there is an inter-ministerial mechanism to coordinate ESD activities. Additionally, meetings are held on a regular basis among the concerned ministries, NGOs, educators and researchers, helping to establish necessary contacts. Since there are many NGOs working in
relevant areas of ESD, it is also critical to forge a network/alliance among the NGOs to make a group representation to hold regular dialogue with the governments.

- Policies relating to language, the mother tongue are contentious issues. The national govt looks at ethnic groups and says, "One ethnic group choose one language and produce your teaching material in that one language." Not everyone can access this right. It is clear that in the government's mind they want one people, one language movement. But there is nothing in law that stops us from promoting our own language.

Wrap-up: We can consider policy in three ways:

*Who should be our target groups in terms of implementation, in carrying the message to policymakers: local community and leaders, researchers, teachers, local NGOs, international community;*  

*How to keep constant touch with the policy or related staff, so they have knowledge & information about what is happening; do more research on new, fresh approaches to help get policy-makers attention;*  

*When doing the project implementation and at same time continue to push the policy; develop foresight and think in terms of long-term changes in policy*
Session 3-B: Sustainability of Projects

Presentation by Mr. MD Nafizuddin Khan of Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)
Powerpoint presentation on DAM's COE project - ACCESS
Powerpoint on DAM's experience with Sustainability (See also Chapter IV)

Presentation/Discussion on DAM's COE project as it relates to sustainability issues

*How do you carry out the needs assessment?*
Formal questionnaire filled out by researchers visiting the field; focal group discussions and summarise discussion findings; using Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) techniques – take the needs assessment back to the community and get them to change or give more feedback

*How do you create and manage all different groups?*
We consider local gov't, community, community-based orgs – we consider all as local stakeholders and develop materials for this group. We have a network of organisations in education and we meet regularly and we organise national level meetings and workshops and through the network we approach national government; at regional level because we are a member of ASPBAE we can participate there.

DAM’s approach is to work with the community, and to support them in linking with others, etc. But the community have to start doing something for themselves, so we encourage them to set up a village organisation with a committee – they decide what they need. Perhaps they decide that because of high illiteracy they need a literacy programme, then we support them in developing a programme. We carry out all our programmes in the Community Learning Centre.

Main points of the discussion

- Sustainability is important – the involvement of parents, teachers & students is important to sustainability of a programme. Sometimes their perspectives can be narrow, so we have to set programmes that help them to understand more and better. The learning and teaching in classroom should relate to their local community – workshops help them to assess whether their school is doing this. This has been a successful initiative for us.

- We have encouraged grassroots organisations and people to develop their own educational materials, which helps in sustaining a project. We have given training in the importance of ESD, how and what to do it and this has also helped.

- Financial sustainability is so important. You need a car, a driver but also petrol. I am encouraged to see some gov't reps here who seem very interested in improving their relevance to their public, and their work. I don't want to keep writing proposals to raise funds for this project after ACCU funds end, so I am going to ask the villagers to sell their mushrooms and to start contributing to the project. I don't know any other solution to this problem.

- PACOS Malaysia – Sabah, A local NGO from Sabah – wide network www.sabah.net.my/pacos, KLF works closely with PACOS

- At community level, what should work is the community's independence. So even when the funding ends, the community must have been improved to move on.

- Example from Thailand – a group of villagers who were empowered and they went on to managing their community forest. The technique of empowering the village is important for sustainability.

- We need to disseminate information about our projects and learning and successes. You need to involve young people, develop their potential, and leadership skills. When older people, who are seen as the gatekeepers, leave then there is a gap. We need to encourage governments to play a role – we have asked governments to support selected students in their studies.
Session 4: Monitoring & Evaluation

Presentation by Mr. Bernie Lovegrove, Asian South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education (ASPBAE)

Discussion on ASPBAE's COE Project related to the M&E topics

What role did the MDGs play in this?
MDGs seemed to be something way above the people, it did not have a relevance to the institutions and individuals who were part of our survey, so we choose to cover the issues.

How did you develop the survey, what tools did you use, and who helped you?
We have networks and partners across the region who have done local, country-level surveys and who have a wide knowledge. We pooled together this knowledge and developed a simple survey that actually takes less than 30 minutes to complete.

What relevance to ESD?
As it is the first year of a five-year project, we wanted to build capacity and credibility. For us, it was important to build these coalitions on education and their capacity, but it is not sufficient. We now want to build a module on ESD so that we can integrate that into our training.

Cooking statistics can be an issue, how did you ensure it didn’t happen?
We ensured that the survey met statistically significant data gathering, there are standards and analysis methods. The feedback that we are getting from the governments & funders is that they accept the credibility of this data.

Discussion on M&E facilitated by Dr. Yoshiyuki Nagata
Participants were asked to fill in answer to “Purpose and Contents of M&E”
- Break into small groups
- One item shared from each group
- Synthesis of individual feedback, shared with the whole group
(Please see categorised comments in Chapter IV)

Discussion
- Qualitative and anecdotal – what is the difference? Anecdotal evidence can be used as data in qualitative data collection.
- Evaluation methods: Most Significant Change method suggested, as a way to help find out unexpected outcomes
- ACCU pointed out the need to include internal Monitoring and Evaluation in the project cycle, and asked each implementing partner to report accordingly, indicating ESD’s relevance and its effectiveness in the respective activities.
Session 5: Effective Communication

1) Presentation by Ms. Manori Wijesekera, TVE Asia Pacific
   Group Exercise and PowerPoint presentation (See Chapter III)
   Group Activity: Azimov Robot exercise

Group Exercise: Hypothetical situation: NGO that has a $1,000 communications budget in Gujarat State. Some relevant information, parameters are given. Group task is to develop a communications strategy for this budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your Organisation profile:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name:</strong> NGO Gujarat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geographic Area of work:</strong> Gujarat, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Thematic focus:</strong> Non-formal education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of work:</strong> working with community based self-help groups in Gujarat, in implementing projects related to improving literacy, health education and advocacy related to land rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>No of staff:</strong> 5 persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communications budget:</strong> Indian Rs 40,000 (approx US$ 1,000) for the next 12 months (1 Dec 2007 to 30 Nov 2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Gujarat State structure:** There is a state government, of elected Ministers who oversee different ministries of the state. Each village has a village head (Panchayat) who is elected every four years.
- **Gujarat Educational sector:** The schools are operated with funds from the state govt. The teachers in local schools are often from Gujarat, and teach more than one subject.

Develop a Communications Strategy for:
- Gujarat State Officials
- Other Community Self-help groups in Gujarat who are not part of your Project
- Gujarat Education Ministry officials
- The community-self help groups, on campaigning for their land rights
- Teachers in Gujarat state

2) Instruction on the Content Management System (CMS) of the ESD Web Site by ACCU

Basic functions of the CMS on the ACCU's ESD Web site were demonstrated as a useful communication tool for project managers of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme to share progress of their own activities. While some of the participants had already uploaded texts and pictures using the CMS, others were invited to take advantage of the decentralised system as part of their communication strategies.

Updated entries of the CMS can be seen on the following pages:
- Innovation Programme for ESD: http://www.accu.or.jp/esd/ip_list.shtml
- COE Programme for ESD: http://www.accu.or.jp/esd/coe_list.shtml
Session 6: Partnership and Networking
PowerPoint Presentation by Mr. Bernie Lovegrove (See also Chapter IV)

Different types of partnership that our organisations are involved in:
  Programme-based
  Technical/expert
  Information exchange network
  With Govt-Civil Society Organisations (CSO)
  Professional network
  Common, bigger goal
  Common target
  Distribution partners

Partnership is a two-way process. So in this two-way process, what we all receive:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IP/COE</th>
<th>ACCU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Funds</td>
<td>wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions</td>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge, M&amp;E, exposure, new groups</td>
<td>Lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust</td>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenge</td>
<td>Capacity building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>Vision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Successful partnership experiences:
- A partnership between different faculties of USP, which are based on different islands, to encourage sharing of information and collaboration between the faculties. A workshop was held to bring people together and to build the initial ties. Reason for success: equal motivation, commitment and enthusiasm
- DAM’s partnership with UNESCO has been very successful. Reasons for success: common goals, resources from UNESCO
- Partnership with Ministry of Education has been effective. Reasons for success: having great leadership and a champion for the partnership at the top. A strong personality, with charisma in the partner has helped.
- Our partnerships with school networks have been effective because of transparency
- Our partnerships have been successful because of regular communication

Partnerships which are not successful – why:
- Ineffective, poor communication
- Competition between partners, some partners don’t want to show their weaknesses
- Protecting their turf, defensiveness and only focussed on self-interest
- Lack of accountability & responsibility
- Lack of respect
- When the terms of reference are not clear, when objectives are unclear, when partners are not clear about responsibility
- Not having a common goal, lack of clear boundaries and not having a personal connection, a relationship
- Poor governance
Partnership principles (arising from discussion)

- Two-way
- Respect
- Resources
- Transparency
- Common/Agreed Goal/Objectives for the duration of the partnership
- Clear Goals/TORs
- Quality of Communications
- Leadership
- Clear allocation of tasks
- Commitment
- Clear Boundaries
- Personal Connection
- Responsibility to each other

What partnerships, collaborations, networking do you need most at the moment? Is there a partnership in your organisation, that is lacking that you would like to initiate, especially one that relates to ESD?
And what needs to be done?
- Responsibility to each other
- advocacy partnership to civil society, to promote ESD
- resource mobilisation
- information sharing

Through one-on-one discussions between organisations, each representative got the opportunity to talk to other participants and explore possibilities for partnerships.
Any feedback to ACCU on factors that may help in the next year’s programme implementation?

It was suggested by participants that stories of “significant change” from across the Innovation Programme (IPs) and even Centre of Excellence (COE) be compiled, to create a product that would introduce, promote and advance ESD. These are stories of an individual (man, woman, child) whose life was changed in some way due to an ESD intervention. The following comments were made on this idea:

- there are many stories already available so not sure how effective this will be
- perhaps at the end of the project year, we can choose one story that reflects the changes
- interested and will plan to submit stories for this compilation
- this could be used for fundraising for ACCU and for IP concept also
- the IP’s interim report had a section on innovation where IPs submitted real life case studies, so this can be the place where we identify the stories
- we are still trying to figure out what ESD is, and we need resource people who can help us understand better.

Although the workshop sessions did not discuss the definition of ESD straightforwardly, a game was introduced halfway through in hopes of helping each participant to internalise some of the essence embedded in ESD. At the invitation of ACCU, Ms. Cresantia Koya of USP came up with the specifics of the game detailed below.

**GAME: Funderstanding ESD**

**Objective:** Individuals will negotiate themselves into teams by currency transactions with members of other groups. These groups will then form teams which will then negotiate their way to the power-source at the centre of the room (X). Teams must get through the gates and collect necessary currency to obtain passage to the centre of the world.

**Number of teams:** 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Team 1:</th>
<th>Team 2:</th>
<th>Team 3:</th>
<th>Team 4:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SOCIETY -4 members ♦</td>
<td>ENVIRONMENT -4 members ☼</td>
<td>ECONOMY -5 members $</td>
<td>CULTURE -6 members ☪</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Summary of the Game:**

Individuals try to build a team with the necessary currency to pass through area boundaries and to reach the centre point or the power-source/ fuel of life. Only the culture group can speak with anyone but cannot make their way alone to the centre. Each team guards their borders from invaders who may pass through if there isn’t at least one person guarding the line.

**Rules:**

1. Find someone of the same group as yourself before you can speak to that person. You must not speak to any member of any other group.
2. Guard your borders.
3. Negotiate the pieces of currency that you need without speaking
4. Do not show your symbol to anyone else unless they ask permission first
5. Negotiate how much one unit of your currency is worth against one of another currency
Getting through the GATES:
A team may use all their currency to get through a gate but that will negate their bargaining power and lead to becoming stranded in a foreign territory. If this happens the team is deported and therefore disqualified.

Lessons:
- Importance of communication skills
- Negotiation
- Listening
- Leadership/governance
- Equity, representation & inclusion
- Partnership
- Shared goals/ vision
- Everyone doesn’t have to go the same way
- We are very sure about our own area, but very cautious in going into another area
- We are all finding our way in ESD, no one really knows exactly what they are doing but if we know the end goal and we reach it, then we have achieved something
- We need clarity on the goals and the reason why we need to do it

Reflection:
What did you like or dislike about the game? What could be changed in your context? Do you think you might be able to use this game to demonstrate the components of ESD and their core-functions, interconnectedness, etc? If you were to use this game as a communications tool, what target group might you use it for? What elements would you change?

In another attempt to deepen understanding of ESD, a brief presentation was made on “ESD and Culture” by Mr. Masanori Kono of ACCU.

As ACCU values the importance of cultural diversity in our everyday work, we believe that cultural aspects should be addressed in envisioning a sustainable future.

- Local wisdom and indigenous knowledge systems can serve as a vehicle for sustainability
- Traditional culture can be labelled as outdated, as opposed to scientific knowledge, but cultural beliefs and traditional knowledge can be a basis for creativity and even scientific innovation that can solve today’s problems
- However, we are also aware of cultural beliefs that reinforce different forms of discriminations and some other taboos that negatively affect people.
- During the second year of the ESD projects, please therefore try to gather local wisdom in support of ESD and apply it to your project activities as opportunities arise.

At this point, participants shared proverbs and indigenous knowledge from their own countries that seem to bear relevance to ESD undertakings.

In the Present there lies the Past
Doing things now is what we can get in the future
To the front we walk only a pace
To the back we walk only a step (A proverb from a Sundanese tribe in Indonesia)

We compare young people to monkeys, in that they start new things but never finish (just like monkeys start eating all kind of fruit but don’t finish eating it) A close relationship with nature: when I was a child I went to river with friends from the village and they threw stones into the river first, and it was to inform the river that I was new and not to be afraid of me. (Malaysia’s indigenous knowledge)

Collection of traditional folktales published in “Tales from the Silk Road” (UNESCO Tashkent, 1999)
Somebody asked the tree, what is your name and the tree answered my fruit is my identity. That means, if the tree has no fruit, it cannot be sustained (Bangladesh)

If the work is done by father and the food is cooked by mother, then the child thinks it is very easy. But you must allow children to learn & experience so they understand it is not so easy. (Bhutan)

Proverb about money, that there are things that money cannot buy. (Mongolia)

If you want to fish, don’t dry the whole river. If you want to hunt, don’t pick the whole forest: it is very hard to plant rice, so don’t waste food (China)

Finally, “Seven Blunders of the World” by Mahatma Gandhi, was introduced on the screen, honouring the wisdom of both the locally and internationally-renowned figure, who had lived long years in the city of Ahmedabad, where participants had spent the six-day workshop together.

Seven Blunders of the World by Mahatma Gandhi

1. Wealth without work
2. Pleasure without conscience
3. Knowledge without character
4. Commerce without morality
5. Science without humanity
6. Worship without sacrifice
7. Politics without principle

Concluding remarks

In highlighting some of the milestone events of the international initiatives such as the DESD’s mid-decade review (2009-2010) and the end of United National Literacy Decade (UNLD) to arrive in 2011, Ms. Shibao of ACCU pointed out opportunities being presented to us in documenting and sharing our collective efforts both quantitatively and qualitatively. To respond to high expectations shown in the Programme, she told of the tentative plans to conduct on-site monitoring to the project sites of the Innovation Programme in the following months, and thereby requested cooperation of each implementing organisation on such occasions. Ms. Shibao concluded remarks by expressing her sincere thanks to the participants in enriching the workshop discussions, and stressed the importance of keeping the momentum created at this workshop for further collaboration.

At the end, participants were asked to write their comments on the most significant points that they had learned from the ICEE as well as the capacity-building workshop.
CHAPTER III

Summary Reports and Presentations

1. Innovation Programme for ESD

   Bhutan
   China
   Indonesia
   Malaysia
   Mongolia
   Nepal
   Palau
   Thailand
   Uzbekistan
   Viet Nam

2. Centre of Excellence (COE) Programme for ESD

   Asian South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education (ASPBAE)
   Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)
   Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)
   TVE Asia Pacific (TVEAP)
   The University of the South Pacific (USP)
Bhutan

Summary of the Project (Year-1)

September 2007

1. Basic data and information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Strategic Action for Enhancement of Farm Products in Rural Communities for Poverty Reduction through Non-Formal Education (NFE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name/Title of Supervisor</td>
<td>Mr. Rinchen Dorji, Senior Program Officer, Non-formal and Continuing Education Division (NFCED), Ministry of Education, Bhutan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name/Title of Project Manager(s)/Officer(s)</td>
<td>Mr. Karma Jurmi, Program Officer, NFCEM, Ministry of Education, Bhutan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Halfway into your two-year project, please report on updated progress of your activities by replying to the following questionnaire.

Summary of the Project

Justification/rationale/strategies to address the issues identified at the outset of the project

No strategic plan of action was ever carried out with the communities themselves to research, analyze and draw up their own plan for reducing poverty. However, with this project we have involved the NFE learners who are basically farmers in the rural areas in carrying out a strategic action for poverty reduction. The main reason for not being able to make a strategic plan of action for poverty alleviation was mainly because of illiteracy. Now with the incorporation of such an ESD project in the general NFE programme, the NFE learners who are mostly farmers have started influencing the life of other farmers in the community, especially in the area of conduction the situational analysis of farming practices and choosing the right and most potential farming enterprises.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Beneficiary groups</th>
<th>Direct or Indirect</th>
<th>In numbers</th>
<th>Characteristics (breakdown by age, sex, ethnicity/language groups, etc)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mendrelgang, tsirang District</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>7 male 20 female</td>
<td>Between 20-25 Southern Bhutanane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bumdeyling, Transhiyangtse District</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>8 male 17 female</td>
<td>Between 15-30 Eastern Bhutanese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakshikhar, Chukha District</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>5 male 22 female</td>
<td>Between 15-28 Central Bhutanese</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tangible Outputs

List tangible items such as brochures/posters, survey results, text books, workshop reports, etc (Please specify the number of copies produced and target users if any)

- 1000 Copies of handbook for conduction Situational Analysis.

Impact of the Project Activities

List intangible aspects of project's impact externally (i.e. Empowerment of the beneficiaries, etc) and internally (i.e. possible perception change in project managers and/or within your own institutions, etc)
### External effects
(For project beneficiaries)

- A culture of sharing ideas and critical thinking was enhanced amongst the NFE Learners. It has also encouraged the collective effort to improve the existing situation.
- It has provided an opportunity to the NFE learners to transform theoretical knowledge into practice.

### Internal effects
(Observed at your organization)

- Being able to experience the actual situation of the rural communities for future planning and implementation of such projects.
- Knowing how to build closer working relation with various agencies and organisation.

### Major Challenges Ahead

What are the major challenges facing you in pursuing your project goals during the second project year?

The major challenges are 1. Replicating the 1st year project activities in as many districts as possible. (Minimum of 3 districts). 2. Monitoring and evaluation of the projects activities, (Due to shortage of manpower in the Head office we have a tough time visiting the projects sites which are located quite far from the head Office).

### 2. Voices of the direct beneficiaries

Please share with us feedback comments of direct beneficiaries of your project by clearly stating their voices and characteristics (names, occupations, roles played in the project, etc).

i. **Tshering, NFE Instructor, and Supervisor in the NFE Centre:** “This project has helped us to demonstrate to the NFE Learners how we could put the theoretical knowledge we gained from the NFE Class into practical form”. “With the orientation workshop given to us through this project I am now confident in learning my NFE learners in conduction the situational analysis of the farming practices, choosing the right enterprise and preparing an action plan for implementation of the work”

ii. **Sangay Om F, NFE learner, Stakeholder of Pakshikhar NFE:** “I would like to thank the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Donor Agency AACCU-Japan for supporting this project which has benefitted us tremendously,” “Before this project we did not know how to choose the right work and kept ourselves too busy with many different tasks without much result. “Now this project has shown us a good method of choosing the most beneficial work with less input, I will try my best to disseminate the knowledge gained to all the farmers in my community.”

iii. **Tashi M ,NFE Learner Bumdeyling:** “I have gained rich experiences through this project Especially in preparing an action plan for the farm work. So far we have wasted a lot of human and material resources due to lack of planning. Now I could follow the plan and use every resource judiciously.”
3. Brief analysis of your project goals from ESD perspectives

According to the Framework for the UNDESD International Implementation Scheme compiled by UNESCO, Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) is considered to have three interlinked key areas (spheres): Society, Environment and Economy with Culture as an underlying dimension. In your particular effort to pursue the ESD goals, which sphere(s) of ESD do you emphasize most? Please share your views by circling the appropriate number on the scale, and state your comments in the box below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Not addressed</th>
<th>Addressed explicitly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Society</td>
<td>1  2  3</td>
<td>4  5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Environment</td>
<td>1  2  3</td>
<td>4  5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Economy</td>
<td>1  2  3</td>
<td>4  5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Culture</td>
<td>1  2  3</td>
<td>4  5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments

We have emphasized the society and the environment the most while pursuing the goal of ESD because we need to promote the value of sharing ideas, working together, thinking critically and collectively, and learning to live together in harmony with nature and society in general. The economic aspects have been rated the least because economic growth can be enhanced only if people learn to live in harmony with the environment and the society.
Bhutan

Presentation

2007 Capacity-Building Workshop titled "Education for Sustainable Development"

➢ Brief history of NFE
➢ Background
➢ Project
➢ Outcome
➢ Values and benefits
➢ Future plans and challenges

History of NFE
1988-1990 Under DDC and NGO
1994 DDC and moe
1996 Education

General Aim
To provide basic functional literacy.
For National Integration and sovereignty
Second golden opportunity.
Promotion of national language
Preservation and promotion of national identity.
Promotion and preservation of culture and environment
Provide life skill Edn.(IGP)
A platform to implement Educational programmes
Introduction

I am Sonam Phuntsho, working as ADEO in Tsirang district from Bhutan. First of all with kind permission from the honorable chairperson and the distinguished resource personnel and participants from different countries, may I take this rare and precious opportunity to extend warmest greetings and best wishes from the people of Bhutan in general and particularly NFCED, MOE.

I. Background

In Bhutan, the ESD project is a two year project. The total cost of the project is 24,000 US Dollars: Sponsored by ACCU-Japan for UNESCO. The first phase of the project had commenced from September 2006 and ended in October 2007. The second phase has started from October 2007 and extends up to September 2008. The very purpose of the project is to help the rural community to create awareness and find out the best and most suitable farming activity for them through a literacy programme. As of now the farmers who are mostly NFE learners are involved in a variety of agricultural activities but they are not aware of the most beneficial farming activity for them in their environment. Hence through this ESD project the community will be able to identify the most lucrative and sustainable farm product. This would enable the community to implement such farming activities to generate income and thereby improve their quality of life.

II. Project

The ESD project is currently launched in three districts namely Mendrelgang Block under Tsirang district, located in central Bhutan, Bumdeling under Trashiyangtse district, located in the extreme east bordering Arunachal Pradesh, India, and Pakshikha in Chukha district situated towards the south of Bhutan. The main activities carried out during the 1st year project were procurement of training equipment like digital camera and lap top, development of handbook for conducting situational analysis of the farming practices, training of the users on handbook usage, training of the NFE learners on improved farming techniques and distribution of an improved variety of seedlings for pilot testing.

I have been managing project activities in Mendrelgang. This district is about 165 KM away from the capital city Thimphu. The project is titled “Strategic Action on Enhancement of farm products for Poverty Reduction through NFE.” Under this scheme, NFE Instructors, School headteachers, local extension agents, community leaders and NFE learners are being trained to conduct situational analysis on farming practices.

The study concluded that *Poultry rearing* is the best for the following reasons;

- Availability of pullets
- Better price and market.
- Access to motorable road.
- Availability of technical guidance.
However, at the moment the project has been called off as the pullets could not be procured owing to the ban and threat posed by Avian Flu, commonly termed “bird flu”. This circumstance has forced the NFE learners and the community to switch over to *Passion fruit cultivation* which was rated as a second most potential enterprise through the situational analysis conducted by the NFE Learners themselves. The reasons are indicated below.

- Project is providing *passion fruit saplings free of cost to motivate the farmers.*
- *The Ministry of Agriculture buys passion fruit to make finished goods*.(Market)
- *Fetches better price.*
- *Technical guidance from local extension agents.*

This farming activity in the long run will have direct bearing on generating a substantial income for the farmers. This project will help the farmers to become self-reliant and sustain their ongoing farming activities. Therefore I strongly feel that ESD has made a meaningful impact on the farmers’ knowledge of the farming practices. Thus the outcome of the ongoing project is the off shoot of ESD and I feel that ESD concept is much related to the ongoing activities.

### III. Outcome of the Project

- **Conducted workshop to develop the handbook on how to carry out the situational analysis studies of farming practices involving community consisting NFE Instructors, head teachers, local extension agents, local leaders and NFE learners,**
- **Translation of handbook into Dzongkha version (National Language) to be used by NFE Learners.**
- **Orientation Workshop for NFE Instructors, head teachers, Agriculture extension workers in three pilot areas.**
- **Printing of handbook is completed.**
- **Conduction of situational analysis studies for NFE learners are completed by the agricultural extension worker and NFE Instructors.**
- **Monitoring and supervision by the Project managers at various levels is underway.**
- **Saplings for passion fruit cultivation are provided.**
- **The study on project impact is underway.**
- **The farmers were able to conduct the situational analysis and choose the right enterprises which will contribute towards the enhancement of farm products.**

The project planning is one of the most important factors that guides and directs the project. Due importance should be given while planning so that all relevant issues pertaining to the project are being incorporated to leave no stones unturned. The project implementation is yet another key component that has to be taken care of to ensure proper implementation of the project. The monitoring and supervision role during the implementation stage is very important. It decides the outcome of the project activities. Hence I strongly feel that planning and implementation should be given highest priority in the line of prioritisation of any project.
IV. Values and benefits of the ESD Project

- The involvement of community, NFE Instructors, NFE learners, head teachers and local leaders, and extension workers for the implementation of the project has strengthened better cooperation and understanding among themselves.
- The project has enabled them to find out their weakness and strength with regard to farming practices.
- The communities, consisting mostly of NFE learners, are getting enhanced support from the extension workers, NFE Instructors and from the local administration.
- The above stakeholders are better informed of farming practices.
- It also has strengthened cooperation and team work in the community.
- The project has made a positive impact in fostering a healthier and happier life in the community.

As a manager of the project, I am able to establish better rapport with community, local leaders, extension workers, NFE Instructors and the NFE learners. This has helped me to monitor and supervise the project in the desired way. On the whole, this project has enabled me to understand problems of the community and report to the authorities for rectifications and for incorporation in the next plan.

V. Future Plans/Challenges

The impact study of the project is well under way; the study reveals that project is making a big difference in the lives of our rural folks. The project will be replicated in the other remaining seventeen districts of Bhutan. ESD plays a very vital role in reducing the poverty in the rural areas. However, this project can only be implemented subject to the availability of funds.

Some of the main challenges that we foresee are the following:

- Shortage of manpower for monitoring and supervision purpose. (Owing to the country’s rugged terrain the effective monitoring becomes questionable as the areas are not connected with motorable road)
- Lack IT facilities for communication purposes. (Most of the rural areas are yet to be connected with power supply)
- Lack of technical expertise (not enough trained people in the particular areas)
- Lack of fund to sustain the project.

With this, I have come to the end of my brief presentation. With the chairman’s kind permission, I would like to thank the workshop organisers for inviting us for this forum. I am very much confident that this deliberation and resolution thus endorsed under the the Auspices of the ACCU-UNESCO ESD Programme will grow from strength to strength and contribute effectively to alleviating the poverty reduction with particular reference to rural areas through ESD literacy
program. Finally, we would like to extend our gratitude for granting generous funds for implementing ESD related project for two years. For your information your project fund has been used judiciously for the upliftment of the living standards in the rural community. Since such type of donor assisted project has a direct benefit for the rural folks we look forward to your continued support and assistance in the years to come. I wish workshop organisers and all participants the very best in implementing ESD Programmes in your respective regions. Last but not least; I would like to extend my heartfelt thanks to ACCU-Japan for sponsoring my trip to this valuable workshop. And I assure you that I in my own small way will help the friends in Bhutan in creating awareness and further promoting ESD-related activities. Trashi Delek

**Proverbs**

- The work is done by the bear but the credit is earned by the monkey. (The hard work is done by subordinates but credit is taken by the boss)
- Skillful articulation is good but one has to practice it.
- Don’t count the days but count achievement (Time taken in achieving set goal is important but result is more important.)
- If it profits you don’t bother even if the bear attacks you.
- God will help you but you must work hard.
- Good virtues possessed by you are important but more important are the good virtues of your partner.
- Given the opportunities and facilities, anyone can excel.
- If a bad ruler is made leader, even water will be measured in terms of cans or units.
- A trusted person will retaliate with mistrust. (Trusted person will always find a way to betray)
- Blow the fire that side; in return your mustache will be burnt. (Do a good turn to others but you will be treated badly)
- When people gather take care of your mouth, when no one is there, take care of your hands. (When a lot of people gather don’t talk too much as if you are the most learned; there could be a much better person than you. When no one is there in the house guard your mind so that your hands will not take advantage of the situation)
- If you don’t have calf muscle on your leg, don’t put lump of muscle on your neck. (If you are not capable don’t accept things for granted, it will ruin you)
China

Summary of the Project (Year-1)

September 2007

1. Basic data and information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>ESD in Rural Primary and Secondary School in China</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name/Title of Supervisor</td>
<td>Dr. Tiedao Zhang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director, China Program Committee of Education for Sustainable Development (CPCESD) and Vice President, Beijing Academy of Educational Sciences (BAES)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Lixia Qian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vice Director, CPCESD and Research Centre for ESD, BAES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name/Title of Project Manager(s)/Officer(s)</td>
<td>Mr. Chunsheng Yao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assistant research fellow, Centre for ESD, BAES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Halfway into your two-year project, please report on updated progress of your activities by replying to the following questionnaire.

Summary of the Project

Justification/rationale/strategies to address the issues identified at the outset of the project

China’s economy has maintained growth at average annual rate of more than 9% in the past 28 years since 1978. However, the pressure of environment and resources that constrain further economic growth in China is increasing. The Chinese government, therefore, has put forward the prospect of scientific development as a fundamental guideline for economic and social development since 2005. And sustainable development is an integral part of the prospect of scientific development.

Reducing the gap between urban and rural areas has become the most urgent task of government in economic and social development and the Chinese government started to practice the policy of building a socialist countryside from 2006. Carrying out education for sustainable development in rural schools will contribute to adapting rural education to meet the needs of rural social and economic development, enhancing the quality of education and promoting sustainable development in rural areas, thus making contributions to building a socialist countryside.

The experiences accumulated in implementing the programme of education for sustainable development in urban areas by CPCESD in the past more than 10 years and research results on ESD obtained will contribute to implementing the programme of ESD in the rural areas in Beijing, Hunan Province and Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region.

The goals of the project are as follows:

- Enhancing the awareness of the staff of local education departments with regard to ESD so as to develop the policy to support ESD;
- Enhancing the awareness and ability of school principals so that they are able to develop the school policy to support ESD in schools;
- Enhancing teachers’ awareness and ability to initiate activities on special topics on ESD and integrate sustainable development into their subject teaching, initiating innovated practices in ESD;
- Providing quality education for young people in rural areas so that they would be equipped with the awareness and ability in terms of sustainable development and are willing to make contributions to local social, economic and environment sustainable development. And under
the guidance of teachers, students will independently carry out activities concerning ESD and initiate some good practices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Beneficiary groups</th>
<th>Direct or Indirect</th>
<th>In numbers (approximately)</th>
<th>Characteristics (breakdown by age, sex, ethnicity/language groups, etc)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School administrators</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>141 persons</td>
<td>80 Male; 61 Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teachers</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>880 persons</td>
<td>215 Male; 665 Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students</td>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>15600 persons</td>
<td>7800 Male; 7800 Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students' parents</td>
<td>Indirect</td>
<td>527 persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>others (from universities, educational department, company etc.)</td>
<td>Indirect</td>
<td>51 persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tangible Outputs**
List tangible items such as brochures/posters, survey results, text books, workshop reports, etc (Please specify the number of copies produced and target users if any)

- ESD subject teaching plans by all teachers in project schools
- Local surveys on ESD from project directors of all project schools
- Beijing local teaching materials entitled “The environment and ESD” used by teachers of all project schools in Beijing
- Hubei Province Honghu City local teaching materials entitled “I Love Mother Lake” used by all teachers of local project schools
- Collections of Beijing rural ESD resource integration used by all teachers of project schools
- Expert report on Workshop of ESD and Subject Teaching used by about 90 backbone teachers in project schools
- Expert report on Third International Forum for ESD used by about 100 backbone school teachers in project schools

**Impact of the Project Activities**
List intangible aspects of project’s impact externally (i.e. Empowerment of the beneficiaries, etc) and internally (i.e. possible perception change in project managers and/or within your own institutions, etc)

**External effects**
(For project beneficiaries)
- ESD Awareness and ability of principals and teachers of project schools enhanced
- ESD has been carried out by teachers in national, local and school curriculum, cultivating ESD awareness and ability of students
- ESD awareness of student parents and community residents for some project schools enhanced

**Internal effects**
(Observed at your organization)
- Strengthening the study and training for ESD in rural primary and secondary schools
- Much importance attached to rural characteristics and integration of various resources in carrying out ESD
- Strengthening the coordination between national project administrators and Inner Mongolia, Hunan and Hubei local project administrators in carrying out ESD

**Major Challenges Ahead**
What are the major challenges facing you in pursuing your project goals during the second project year?

- As the majority of project schools are located in rural areas and funds for project schools are very tight, the limited funds from ACCU project restricted the opportunity for principals and teachers of project schools to have exchanges.
The second year of the project is crucial for project implementation and it needs more exchanges and guidance. Project schools in China are located in four municipalities, provinces and autonomous regions such as Beijing, Inner Mongolia, Hunan and Hubei, causing inconvenience for project management, monitoring and evaluation.

There are only two years available for innovative projects, and it is, therefore, difficult for some project schools to meet the expected target for project implementation in such a short time.

2. Voices of the direct beneficiaries
Please share with us feedback comments of direct beneficiaries of your project by clearly stating their voices and characteristics (names, occupations, roles played in the project, etc).

I am a secondary school student, a new participant in the project. I felt through group activities that teachers are cordial, what we learned is live knowledge and we often went out for visits and practice, broadening our horizons. I had never seen coloured sweet potato and peanut, never seen so closely a spaceship (model) and space clothes. I had never personally picked pears, dug out sweet potatoes and planted water melons. You may laugh at me that though my home town is in Panggezhuang, which is well-known as a water melon producer, I never knew or even imagined that there would be so many varieties of water melon. It is true what the teacher said, that for 365 professions, every profession produces its own leading authority. I have learned from practice and I am determined to study hard and apply the scientific knowledge I have learned to build my hometown. If I cannot become a university student in the future, I would become a dab hand, like Grandpa Li Baosen, at planting melons. In a word, I would like to make my contribution to my hometown. (Female student from Panggezhuang Secondary School, Daxing, Beijing)

After participating in the project and through the lectures of teachers, I got to know that we should protect the Earth, as we are all living on it. To protect the Earth, we should start from a small matter, such as taking good care of the environment, saving water, and telling Papa and Mama to drive less so as to save energy and protect the environment. I also know that we should save electricity etc and cultivate a good habit of saving. Take good care of small animals and treat them well. (Male student from Dadongliu Central Primary School, Beijing)

After being involved with the programme, there is a great change in my own behaviour. Unhealthy habits such as going in for ostentation and extravagance and smoking have been dropped. Awareness of green consumption, saving and environment protection in shopping have been enhanced, my action also has impact on others around. (Principal, male, Dadongliu Central Primary School, Beijing)

I disseminate in an active way the concept of ESD to other teachers and residents around, hoping that a natural and humane environment in nearby areas would be improved so as to provide good life conditions and environment. In the whole process, it is certainly essential for my taking the lead in practice. Many bad habits in my life and work have been dropped while trying to set an example in this respect. (Tian xiaofei, male teacher, Yangfang Secondary School, changping, Beijing)

A few years ago, I took the pupils of Grade 5 in primary school to visit Maoping River, which is nearby the school, finding that due to small paper-making factories scattered on both sides of the river like stars in the sky, fish and shrimp that were available in the past can no longer be seen now. On the surface of the river there was a layer of dark waste materials and bad smells were
sent forth from some sections of the river. Some pupils sighed, saying that it should be called stinking ditch instead of Maoping River. If my home were located nearby, I would ask my parents to move as soon as possible. After returning to school, the pupils used “Sweeping Maoping River”, “Maoping’s Yesterday and Today” as the titles for their report for the visit, depicting the past and present of Maoping River. And some pupils changed the titles to “a letter to county head”, or “a letter to director for environment department”, reporting what they have found during the visit. Their action has drawn the attention of local government. The government decided to close all small paper-making factories, returning cleanliness to the river. Now green grass is growing on both sides of the river, fish in the river are jumping freely. The principal said that this activity not only taught pupils a lot, and pupils have learned a lot of knowledge, it also benefits the school for more publicity. (Teacher, Female, Hope School donated by PLA force stationed in Hang Kong, Hubei Province)

3. Brief analysis of your project goals from ESD perspectives

According to the Framework for the UNDESD International Implementation Scheme compiled by UNESCO, Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) is considered to have three interlinked key areas (spheres): Society, Environment and Economy with Culture as an underlying dimension. In your particular effort to pursue the ESD goals, which sphere(s) of ESD do you emphasize most? Please share your views by circling the appropriate number on the scale, and state your comments in the box below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sphere</th>
<th>Not addressed</th>
<th>Addressed explicitly</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Society</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Environment</td>
<td>1 2</td>
<td>4     5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Economy</td>
<td>1 2</td>
<td>4     5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Culture</td>
<td>1 2</td>
<td>4     5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

as an underlying dimension

Comments

CPCESD is focusing on three areas and culture behind. In the social area, the topics are life and safety, civic right and duty and harmonious society. In the environmental area, the topics are environment protection and natural disaster prevention. In the economic area, the topics are cycling economy and green consumption, rural development and sustainable urbanization. And for culture the topics are national culture and culture diversification. All project schools are required to integrate ESD of these topics into national curriculum.

On the other hand, a special emphasis would be laid by project schools in their implementation according to the research level and characteristics of the area. For example, Beijing Yangfang Secondary School made full use of local natural and cultural resources. Hubei Caidian Primary School laid emphasis on using economic resources, building up an ecological type of school. Hubei Honglu Primary School No 1 worked on wet land protection. Beijing Shunyi Gaoliying Primary School was working on building a harmonious school, laying special emphasis on ESD in the social area.
Progress Report of ACCU/ESD Pilot in Rural China

Yao Chunsheng
On behalf of
China Program Committee for ESD Project (CPCESD) &
Beijing Academy of Educational Sciences (BAES)
Nov. 17, 2007

Outline
1. Introduction
2. Program Implementation
3. Outcome and Innovations
4. Follow-up Activities

1. Introduction
1.1 Background
1.1.1 China Features: Population 56%
1.1.2 National Policies
   - Scientific Outlook on Development
   - New Socialist Countryside
1.1.3 International Trends
   - UNDESDE
   - ACCU-UNESCO Innovation Program on ESD

1.2 Objectives
1.2.1 Awareness and Values
1.2.2 Ability
1.2.3 Actions

2. Program Implementation
2.1 Set up Institutional Structure

2.2 Choosing Project Schools

Figure 1 Institutional network for ACCU project.
2.3 Local Survey

2.4 Teacher Training
2.4.1 National Training
2.4.1.1 National Workshops and International Forums

2.4.2 Local Training

2.4.3 Training at School Level

2.5 Use of ICT

3. Outcome and Innovations
- Good start
- Remarkable Achievements
  - Curriculum
  - School Development
  - Using Local Resources
  - Involving Multi-stakeholders